

Implementation of Public Policy for Street Vendors Arrangements in Bandung City

Isra Muksin

Universitas Bumi Hijrah, Indonesia

Correspondent : isram23@unibrahtidore.ac.id

Received : Desember 26, 2023

Accepted : January 09, 2024

Published : January 26, 2024

Citation: Muksin, I. (2024). Implementation of Public Policy for Street Vendors Arrangements in Bandung City. Idscipub Public Administration and Political Science and International Relations, 2(1), 25-37

ABSTRACT: This research delves into the complex issues surrounding the implementation of public policy aimed at organizing street vendors in Bandung City. The presence of street vendors has become intertwined with concerns related to public order and security, frequently culminating in conflicts between these vendors and government authorities seeking to regulate their presence in prohibited public areas. Motivated to resolve disputes without violence, the Bandung City Government has called for immediate measures to manage street vendors effectively. This study seeks to understand the factors hindering the effective implementation of the policy on street vendor arrangement, exploring whether the policy execution aligns with the planned actions and its subsequent impact on both individuals and groups within society. Utilizing qualitative research methods, including observation, in-depth interviews, and document studies, this research engages key informants such as executing officials, beneficiaries, affected groups, and relevant stakeholders involved in the Local Regulation on Structuring of Street Vendors in Bandung City. Employing the implementation theory and model from Grindle (2017), examining policy implementation considers the nuances contributing to its ineffectiveness. The findings reveal many challenges, including conflicting interests, ongoing debate on policy benefits, overlapping goals, limited decision-making authority, inadequate resources, and contextual conflicts between governmental and non-governmental entities. The study concludes that a comprehensive strategy is required to address these challenges and foster stakeholder collaboration to enhance the policy's effectiveness.

Keywords: Public Policy, Implementation, Street Vendors, Public Administration, Bandung City.



This is an open-access article under the
CC-BY 4.0 license

INTRODUCTION

Street vendors, commonly called PKL (Pedagang Kaki Lima), represent a ubiquitous presence, particularly in urban settings, contributing significantly to the informal sector's provision of goods and services. While their existence yields advantages for consumers, the government, and traders by mitigating unemployment and offering various necessities at affordable prices, the negative

urban environmental impact is the downside. Street vendors are often criticized for creating an untidy, disorderly atmosphere and utilizing public facilities. This predicament underscores the absence of meticulous planning and oversight in urban development, resulting in the uncontrolled and spontaneous growth of street vending (Higuera et al., 2023; Liu & Liu, 2022; Rosales et al., 2023; Yanuasri, 2015).

PKL, emblematic of people's economic activities, encompasses individuals selling goods or food using wheeled carts or stalls along shop fronts and sidewalks. Indonesia exhibits a pervasive presence of street vendors across regions, with a preference for crowded locales such as markets, transportation hubs, and tourist attractions (Abdullah et al., 2023). Their merchandise varies widely, encompassing market snacks, culinary offerings, and second-hand items like shoes and tools, catering to diverse community needs. The socio-economic importance of street vendors in fostering economic growth, particularly for the lower middle class, underscores their prevalence, influenced by factors such as economic challenges, limited job prospects, and urbanization (Bakhri, 2021; Bantie et al., 2023; Verma et al., 2023).

However, the emergence of street vendors is also rooted in weak supervision and urban spatial planning that displaces productive land, transforming agricultural spaces into construction zones. This compels some individuals to engage in street vending as an economic pursuit. Conversely, their presence is not without drawbacks, contributing to traffic disruptions by occupying roadsides and sidewalks, resulting in congestion and litter. Despite these inconveniences, affordable prices attract many patrons to street vendors. Consequently, there is a pressing need for proactive measures by the Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP), including eviction operations, to address regulatory violations by street vendors and maintain urban order (Fatimah, 2011; Taufik, 2012).

Bandung Mayor Regulation Number 032 of 2019 concerning Second Amendment to Bandung Mayor Regulation Number 888 of 2012 concerning Guidelines for Implementing Bandung City Regional Regulation Number 04 of 2011 concerning Arrangement and Development of Street Vendors is the basis for implementing Bandung City government policy in organizing and developing street vendors in Bandung City. However, in its implementation, it faces obstacles and challenges, such as refusing street vendors to relocate and choosing to return to selling locations prohibited from selling for street vendors according to the Bandung mayor's regulations. The operation carried out by the Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) seemed to leave no trace because every time it was controlled, the street vendors returned to selling in prohibited places the next day (Abidin, 2021; Tasya et al., 2022; Warlina, Yusuf, S Ramadhani, & I Ohoitmur, 2021).

The presence of street vendors in Bandung City is intricately entwined with issues of public order and security, frequently leading to conflicts between these vendors and government officials attempting to regulate their presence in prohibited public areas, such as roads, road shoulders, sidewalks, city parks, and other public spaces. This often results in physical confrontations between street vendors and Bandung City Satpol PP officers. Urgent calls are made for the Bandung City Government to promptly resolve these conflicts and implement effective measures for organizing street vendors, emphasizing avoiding violence (Abidin, 2021; Tasya et al., 2022; Warlina et al., 2021).

Within the broader context of public policy, initiatives designed to bring about societal, political, and economic changes can trigger resistance from parties whose interests are jeopardized by the policy (Grindle, 2017, 2021; Lowi et al., 2023; Lowi et al., 2022; Schaefer, 2012). This resistance is evident in the policy for structuring street vendors in Bandung, where various parties, including

officials who benefit from security payments collected from street vendors, oppose the policy. Despite control efforts by the Bandung City Satpol PP, they prove ineffective, as disciplined street vendors often resume selling in the exact locations the day after enforcement. Limited human resources, represented by Satpol PP officers, and constrained financial resources contribute to the perception that efforts to organize street vendors in Bandung City are mainly ceremonial, lacking substantive impact in practice. The implementation of this policy appears to be symbolic, raising questions about its practical efficacy (Abidin, 2021; Ramadhan, 2015).

Programs designed to yield collective benefits for a broad audience typically garner support and high compliance levels from target groups or the general public (Grindle, 2017, 2021; Lowi et al., 2023, 2022; Schaefer, 2012). However, implementing the policy for structuring street vendors in Bandung City deviates from this norm. Despite the potential to benefit many, community support for this program in Bandung is notably minimal. The residents of Bandung City often prioritize short-term considerations, seeking daily necessities easily accessible through street vendors operating in strategic but prohibited locations within the city (Abidin, 2021; Ramadhan, 2015).

Compounding this challenge is the long-term nature of the PKL Arrangement policy, necessitating behavioral changes within the community for benefits that may not be immediately tangible. Consequently, the implementation encounters resistance and difficulties. While the people of Bandung City acknowledge the traffic congestion and disorder caused by street vendors, the establishment of the PKL Arrangement Task Force, comprising various Regional Work Units (SKPD) of the Bandung City Government, has dispersed decision-making authority organizationally. This dispersion has impeded decision-making processes and complicated program implementation, involving increasing decision-making units (Abidin, 2021; Ramadhan, 2015; Tasya et al., 2022).

Examining the ontological foundation of policy formulation for street vendor structuring in Indonesia reveals mixed outcomes. While the policy proves effective in some areas, achieving its implementation targets, its impact remains imperceptible in other regions. This suggests the existence of specific factors undermining the effectiveness of the PKL structuring policy. Furthermore, variations in target groups involved in street vendor structuring influence the implementation outcomes in specific regions. These factors constitute a focal point of inquiry in this research endeavor (Alwi et al., 2023; Warlina, Yusuf, S Ramadhani, & I Ohoitumur, 2021).

The conceptual framework of this study draws on multiple strands of literature to comprehensively examine the challenges and dynamics surrounding the implementation of public policy for street vendor arrangements in Bandung City. Grounded in the urban development and public policy literature, mainly focusing on informal sector dynamics, urban spatial planning, and policy implementation theories, such as Grindle's framework (2017), the study seeks to elucidate the multifaceted nature of street vending phenomena and its implications for urban governance. Central to the framework is recognizing street vendors as pivotal actors in the informal economy, whose presence intersects with urban planning deficiencies, socio-economic disparities, and governance challenges. The study also incorporates public administration and governance insights, emphasizing the role of regulatory mechanisms, stakeholder dynamics, and decision-making processes in shaping policy outcomes. Furthermore, the framework underscores the significance of understanding the complex interplay between formal regulations, enforcement practices, and socio-economic realities. By integrating these theoretical perspectives, the study aims to offer a nuanced understanding of the contextual factors influencing the effectiveness of street vendor

policies and inform policy recommendations for enhancing urban governance and inclusivity in Bandung City.

Based on the background explanation, this study has three research questions: (1) What are the key challenges hindering the effective implementation of public policy to organize street vendors in Bandung City, particularly concerning regulating their presence in prohibited public areas? (2) How do factors such as weak supervision, urban spatial planning, and various stakeholders' resistance influence the policy's implementation for structuring street vendors in Bandung City? (3) What are the perceptions, attitudes, and behaviors of street vendors, government officials, and community members regarding the policy for street vendor arrangement in Bandung City?

This study investigates the challenges and barriers inherent in implementing public policy concerning street vendor arrangements in Bandung City, emphasizing regulatory compliance and conflict resolution as focal points. It seeks to examine the intricate interplay of factors such as weak supervision, urban spatial planning, and stakeholder resistance in molding the implementation dynamics of the policy aimed at structuring street vendors within the city. Additionally, the research endeavors to delve into the perceptions, attitudes, and behaviors of street vendors, government officials, and community members regarding the policy for street vendor arrangement in Bandung City to comprehensively understand their perspectives and motivations underlying their involvement in the policy implementation process.

METHOD

This study employs a qualitative research design, specifically utilizing a case study approach to delve into the complexities surrounding the implementation of public policy for street vendor arrangements in Bandung City (Creswell, 2017; Creswell & Creswell, 2018; Johnson & Stake, 2005; Yin, 2012). The case study methodology offers an in-depth exploration of the phenomenon within its real-life context, allowing for a nuanced understanding of the multifaceted issues associated with street vendor structuring (Denzin & Lincoln, 2017; Yin, 2012).

In addition to the case study approach, this research incorporates Grindle's Theory and Model of Public Policy Implementation (2017). Grindle's theoretical framework provides a structured lens through which to analyze the complexities and challenges encountered during the implementation of public policy, offering insights into the factors influencing effectiveness and potential strategies for improvement (Grindle, 2017, 2021).

The sampling strategy involves purposive sampling to select key informants crucial to the case, including executing officials, beneficiaries, and affected groups related to the Local Regulation on Structuring of Street Vendors in Bandung City. This targeted approach ensures the inclusion of participants with significant insights into the policy implementation process. Direct observations of street vendor activities, the dynamics of enforcement efforts, and the community's response provide valuable insights into the practical aspects of policy implementation. Structured and semi-structured interviews with executing officials, beneficiaries, and affected groups aim to gather rich, qualitative data regarding their perspectives, experiences, and perceptions regarding street vendor structuring policies. Analysis of relevant documents, including the Local Regulation on Structuring of Street Vendors, official reports, and correspondence, aids in understanding the policy framework, its evolution, and its impact (Kiger & Varpio, 2020; Lawless & Chen, 2019; Miles et al., 2020; Molin et al., 2016; Scharp & Sanders, 2019; Watkins, 2017).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The Bandung City Government has enacted the policy for structuring street vendors through Bandung City Mayor Regulation (PERWALI) Number 32 of 2019, amending Bandung Mayor Regulation Number 888 of 2012, which pertains to the execution of Bandung City Regional Regulation Number 04 of 2011, delineating the organization and development of street vendors. Following Grindle's perspective, the success of policy implementation is contingent upon the depth to which the policy is effectively executed (Grindle, 2017, 2021). This execution is intricately tied to the policy's content, encompassing affected interests, types of benefits, envisioned degree of change, decision-making locus, program implementor, and allocated resources.

The stakeholders directly influenced by this policy comprise two primary entities: 1) Street vendors in Bandung City, constituting the target group, and 2) The Bandung City Government, acting as the policy implementer. The target group refers to individuals or organizations within society poised to receive goods and services, and their behavior is apt to be molded by the policy. The aim is for this group to assimilate and embrace the interaction patterns stipulated by the policy.

The target group for this policy encompasses street vendors dispersed across Bandung City, along with community members indirectly impacted by the restructuring initiative. Local government officials overseeing the areas where street vendors are subject to restructuring play a pivotal role in disseminating this policy. Their familiarity with the socio-economic conditions of residents enables a tailored approach during outreach efforts, fostering greater acceptance and support for street vendor structuring policies. Equally significant are community figures who, due to their influence, hold sway over the opinions and positions adopted by street vendors. The latter, particularly those operating in the six affected sub-districts in Bandung City, represent the primary demographic directly affected by the structuring policy. This group constitutes the lifeblood of daily operations at the arrangement locations and experiences the most substantial impact from this policy.

In the wake of the restructuring policy, street vendors confront the loss of their business spaces and grapple with the erosion of income derived from years of vending. Consequently, a judicious socialization approach and method are imperative to garner support and active participation from street vendors affected by this policy. This necessitates a comprehensive understanding of the intricacies involved, ensuring that the outreach strategies are tailored to address the specific challenges and concerns the affected stakeholders face.

The impacts stemming from this policy manifest symbolically and materially on the target group, defining the essence of public policy impact. In line with the fundamental tenet of policy benefits, each policy should ideally yield positive effects on its recipients. Structuring street vendors in Bandung City requires a continual focus on the human element as both the subject and object of development. This underscores the importance of aligning development endeavors with human desires and noble values, ensuring that, when appropriate, the results of development efforts translate into maximum benefits for human life.

Within the policy for street vendor structuring, due regard must be given to the human element and its myriad interactions shaping social life. Consequently, mitigating the negative impacts on street vendors and accentuating the positive outcomes become imperative. An evaluation of the benefits crucial for the success of street vendor structuring in Bandung City requires a

comprehensive examination of the implementation process. This evaluation extends beyond mere relocation, encompassing the broader social impact on the community following the implementation of the structuring policy.

While the policy envisions positive aspirations for street vendors through relocation, the actualization faces hurdles. Accessing suitable land for relocation becomes increasingly challenging, and even when available, the locations often lie distant from bustling city centers. This discrepancy shapes the psychological state of street vendors, evident in their expressions during interviews and focus group discussions, reflecting a general sentiment of dissatisfaction. Jealousy and potential conflicts arise between relocated and non-relocated street vendors, mainly when the new location is distant from busy centers, allowing unallocated vendors to continue operations in designated zones.

In practice, the anticipated benefits of relocation are not always realized. The scarcity of suitable land and the resultant distant locations impact the psychological well-being of street vendors, leading to dissatisfaction and potential conflicts. Despite the hope for a decent and permanent selling place post-relocation, the reality often falls short. The Bandung City government encourages legal trade in designated areas for street vendors, but some vendors' concerns about merchandise sales and financial obligations persist.

Street vendors subjected to stringent controls share common characteristics, primarily hailing from surrounding areas like Bandung Regency, West Bandung Regency, Garut Regency, and Sumedang Regency. While generally supportive of the Bandung City government's street vendor structuring program, they express concerns about potential adverse impacts on their livelihoods. Despite supporting the policy, they hope it will not undermine their businesses and seek government assistance in providing suitable replacement locations.

Street vendors affected by the structuring policy have interests focused on continuity in selling locations not far from their current spots to retain regular customers. The Bandung City Government has encountered varying issues in addressing the relocation challenge, especially concerning the third relocation criterion. Acknowledging these challenges, the government is committed to prioritizing resolution efforts to reach an understanding and facilitate appropriate relocation requests. The street vendors must grapple with conditions set forth during the relocation process, including refraining from returning to old locations, refraining from selling relocated kiosks, and adhering to predetermined rental agreements.

The relocation of street vendors to markets or designated PKL Zones has triggered a surge in kiosk prices, deemed exorbitant for Bandung City. Some vendors exploit sales proceeds by reselling their stalls at significantly higher prices than the initial purchase cost. Establishing trade infrastructure for street vendors necessitates substantial investment, entails a protracted payback period, and involves sophisticated technology. The planning and executing such infrastructure are time-consuming endeavors, essential for achieving a specific economic scale. This endeavor encompasses two dimensions - the physical and the service - where infrastructure is not merely a physical entity but requires an operational focus on service quality and effective management.

Considering the multifaceted challenges in infrastructure development for street vendors, preemptive efforts are crucial to minimize emergent issues. Acting as the infrastructure developer, the government must calculate non-physical compensation, address economic setbacks for street vendors impacted by restructuring, and formulate policies to facilitate relocation. This process necessitates community readiness assessment to avert potential social conflicts between residents

and migrating street vendors. The intricacies in determining relocation recipients, involving both direct and indirect parties, compounded by third parties purchasing stalls, contribute to the complexities in implementing the structuring policy in Bandung City.

The anticipated degree of change resulting from the PKL structuring policy in Bandung City hinges on successful program socialization and subsequent relocation stages. Activities encompass determining relocation land, land measurement, standardizing prices, joint deliberations, and rental payments. Street vendors' acceptance of the policy aligns with the government's staged activities, involving various stakeholders such as government officials, entrepreneurs, community leaders, and others. This collaborative approach is pivotal for a smooth and successful implementation process.

Several PKL relocation zones are deemed successful in implementing the policy, attributing success to the presence of respected community figures and proactive government officials. Community figures play a crucial role by providing insights and guidance on street vendor arrangements, while government officials act as catalysts by actively promoting the policy in community activities. This harmony fosters optimism among street vendors, aligning their perception of government programs with progressive societal advancement.

The policy's impact extends beyond economic considerations, fostering stronger relationships among street vendors and between vendors and government officials at various administrative levels. It affirms street vendors' willingness to adhere to Regional Regulations governing PKL arrangements in Bandung City. Positioned as a catalyst for economic growth and tourism development, the policy opens avenues for new economic and trade sectors. This, in turn, is expected to balance regional development and support Greater Bandung's progress as a crucial component of West Java province. The economic and trade expansion is poised to generate employment opportunities and elevate the region's attractiveness to external investors. Through the structured arrangement of street vendors, the policy aims to augment the Regional Original Income (PAD) and captivate external investments, particularly in Bandung City and the broader West Java Province.

The entity responsible for executing the policy on structuring street vendors is the Bandung City Cooperatives and MSMEs Service, established through a decree from the Mayor of Bandung. This service, funded by the Bandung City Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBD), oversees policy development. Simultaneously, Satpol PP plays a direct role in enforcing regulations related to street vendors. While executing the policy, the Cooperatives and MSMEs Department encounters misunderstandings, contradictions, and occasional dissatisfaction from street vendors due to procedural disparities. The Department operates per specified procedures, causing discord with unfamiliar street vendors. For instance, an inventory precedes calculations according to city regulations and the Appraisal Team's findings during relocation processes, determining the relocation land allocated to street vendors.

The relocation process adheres to a staged approach, with each affected street vendor's relocation determined after completing the inventory. Stringent rules are imposed by the Bandung City Government, prohibiting transactions, rentals, contracts, or any activities on measured land. This firm stance simplifies the Department's task in implementing street vendor structuring through relocation. Transparency is crucial in implementing policies, with the Cooperatives and MSMEs Department emphasizing adherence to Regional Regulations governing street vendor arrangements in Bandung City.

Transparent socialization and communication of Regional Regulations by the Department of Cooperatives and MSMEs is imperative to enhance understanding. Input from street vendors highlights the perceived inadequacy of socialization efforts, underscoring the need for more effective outreach. The Department's role is pivotal due to its comprehensive grasp of laws and regulations governing street vendor arrangements compared to local government officials.

Future efforts should emphasize collaboration between City, District, and Ward Governments to enhance outreach activities, relocation processes, and data integrity. Such collaboration mitigates the risk of data manipulation and the emergence of non-stall owners acting as intermediaries. Conducting a simultaneous and comprehensive inventory, possibly with assistance from other competent agencies, is crucial to address challenges related to relocation land and staged rental payment mechanisms post-relocation.

Addressing the attitude problem of policy implementers, particularly in the field, requires attention to incentives. Recognizing that individuals act based on their interests, manipulating incentives becomes a strategic technique for policymakers to influence implementers' actions. Policymakers can motivate implementers to fulfill specified tasks by altering profits or costs. This approach serves to align personal or group interests with policy objectives.

The implementation system involves PKL Arrangement officers, the City, District, and Ward-level apparatus within the Bandung City Government, with the Ward Head as part of the Task Force collaborating with the Cooperatives and MSMEs Service. The Ward Head assumes a crucial role as a field officer in street vendor arrangements due to their proximity and responsibility for the community in their respective areas. The collaborative efforts of these figures underscore the importance of localized involvement in effective policy execution.

To fortify the context of implementation, it is imperative to refine implementers' strategies and foster compliance and responsiveness to street vendor structuring policies. These policies should undergo continuous socialization utilizing an approach tailored to the characteristics of local street vendors, incorporating stages that facilitate their active involvement. Additionally, harmonies must be integrated with other institutions and programs supporting community expectations, such as empowerment, education, training, public facilities, and infrastructure improvements. Successful policy implementation hinges on unwavering commitment from all involved parties. Challenges in the City of Bandung's PKL arrangement, deviating from established plans due to budget constraints and political interventions, necessitate a renewed commitment. Reaffirming commitment from all sectors and support from other programs is vital to achieving the broader societal impact envisioned.

Recognizing the diverse perceptions and expectations of street vendors is crucial. Community perceptions and expectations influence public acceptance or rejection of street vendor structuring policies in Bandung City. These findings underscore the need for a unified physical and non-physical environment in Bandung City's development that garners community support. Developing infrastructure for street vendor relocation, particularly land procurement, poses challenges. The constitutional basis for land relationships requires a delicate balance between state authority and citizen land rights. Policies aimed at structuring street vendors intend to bring positive societal changes, but resistance from some vendors prompts a reevaluation of public development perceptions. Implementers must re-evaluate socialization approaches, ensuring a solid understanding and community support for successful policy implementation. Dynamics in

the field, whether resistance or support, should inform future strategies related to street vendor structuring.

The following table provides a structured overview of the key findings from the in-depth interviews regarding the policy for structuring street vendors in Bandung City, highlighting categories, themes, and conclusions.

Table 1. Structured Overview of The Key Findings Regarding The Policy

Categories	Themes	Conclusion
Target Group	- Street vendors in Bandung City - Community members indirectly impacted by restructuring	- Target group includes street vendors and indirectly impacted community members - Key demographic directly affected by restructuring policy
Socialization Approach	- Tailored approach by local government officials - Influence of community figures	- Tailored approach by local officials fosters greater acceptance - Influence of community figures crucial for shaping opinions of street vendors
Impacts	- Material and symbolic manifestations - Alignment with human desires and values	- Policy aims to bring positive impacts to street vendors - Emphasis on the human element crucial for the development - Policy should align with human desires and values for maximum benefits
Challenges	- Land scarcity and distance from city centers - Psychological impact on street vendors	- Challenges in accessing suitable land and the psychological well-being of vendors - Actual benefits of relocation often fall short
Vendor Concerns	- Business continuity and location proximity - Support for policy with concerns for livelihoods	- Vendors seek continuity in selling locations near current spots - Concerns about policy impact on livelihoods despite support for the policy
Implementation Process	- Government departments and agencies involved - Collaborative efforts and localized involvement	- Various government bodies involved in the execution - Collaboration and localized involvement are crucial for effective implementation
Infrastructure Development	- Investment and time required - Challenges in infrastructure development	- Investment and time needed for infrastructure development - Preemptive efforts crucial to minimize issues
Policy Impact	- Economic growth and tourism development - Augmentation of Regional Original Income (PAD)	- Policy aims to foster economic growth and attract investments - Expected benefits include increased income and regional attractiveness
Transparency	- Transparency in policy implementation - Importance of socialization	- Transparent implementation crucial for success - Effective socialization is necessary to ensure understanding and support
Collaboration	- Collaboration between government levels - Enhanced outreach activities	- Collaboration needed between different levels of government - Outreach activities must be improved for better implementation

Categories	Themes	Conclusion
Incentives	- Use of incentives to influence behavior - Aligning interests with policy objectives	- Incentives can be used to align interests with policy objectives
Community Support	- Importance of community support - Role of formal and informal approaches	- Community support is crucial for success - Formal and informal approaches needed to accommodate diverse community characteristics
Harmony	- Need for harmony between institutions - Integration of various strategies	- Collaboration is essential for a streamlined process - Integration of strategies necessary for success

Source: Research data processing results (2024)

Most of the interviewed street vendors support organizing street vendors in Bandung City. Acknowledging negative sentiments about irregularities in the PKL structuring policy, community support remains crucial for preserving high trust in government policies. Resistance and support from all parties must be considered in implementing subsequent PKL arrangement stages. A sustainable approach, both formal and informal, is necessary to accommodate varying community characteristics and the staged nature of PKL arrangements. The Department of Cooperatives, MSMEs, and Satpol PP play pivotal roles, requiring rule adherence and heightened responsiveness to societal dynamics.

Acknowledging that street vendor structuring policies do not operate in isolation, there is a pressing need for harmony between institutions and fields. This collaboration is essential to streamline the process and stages of structuring street vendors while aligning with community desires. Beyond land relocation, outreach activities, empowerment, and public infrastructure improvements should be part of a cohesive strategy. Realizing this harmony mandates a reassessment of relationships between governments and institutions, optimizing their roles and functions to bolster the success of street vendor management policies in Bandung City. This approach aims to amplify community access to express their desires and enhance implementers' responsiveness in the field.

CONCLUSION

The study identifies the target group affected by the policy, primarily street vendors in Bandung City and community members indirectly impacted by restructuring. It underscores the significance of tailored approaches by local government officials and the influential role of community figures in shaping the opinions of street vendors.

Examining policy impacts reveals the importance of aligning policy objectives with human desires and values to maximize benefits. Challenges such as land scarcity, distance from city centers, and psychological impacts on street vendors underscore the complexities in realizing anticipated benefits, emphasizing the need for nuanced approaches in policy implementation.

The concerns and attitudes of street vendors, government officials, and community members highlight the delicate balance between supporting policy objectives and safeguarding livelihoods. Vendors express the need for business continuity and proximity to current locations, while

government agencies acknowledge the challenges in infrastructure development and collaborative efforts required for effective implementation.

The study emphasizes the crucial role of transparency in policy implementation and the necessity for enhanced collaboration between government levels to improve outreach activities and ensure successful implementation. Recognizing the importance of community support and the need for harmony between institutions and fields, the study advocates for a sustainable approach that accommodates diverse community characteristics and integrates various strategies beyond land relocation.

While the policy for structuring street vendors in Bandung City holds promise for economic growth and development, its successful implementation necessitates addressing challenges, fostering collaboration, and aligning policy objectives with stakeholder interests. By heeding these insights, policymakers can navigate complexities and realize the broader societal impacts envisioned for the city's street vendor management policies.

REFERENCE

- Abdullah, T., Lee, C., & Carr, N. (2023). Defining success and failure in the hospitality industry's microenterprises: A study of Indonesian street food vendors. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 109, 103403. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2022.103403>
- Abidin, Z. (2021). Sinergitas Dalam Pembinaan dan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kota Bandung. *Jurnal Caraka Prabhu*, 3(2), 224–238. <https://doi.org/10.36859/jcp.v3i2.359>
- Alwi, A., Lihawa, F., & Rusiyah, R. (2023). Sebaran Pedagang Kaki Lima Dalam Perspektif Rencana Detail Tata Ruang Di Kecamatan Duingi, Kota Gorontalo. *Geosfera: Jurnal Penelitian Geografi*, 1(2), 56–62. <https://doi.org/10.34312/geojpg.v1i2.15085>
- Bakhri, S. (2021). Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima: Resiliensi Usaha di Masa Pandemi. *Al-Mustashfa: Jurnal Penelitian Hukum Ekonomi Syariah*, 6(2), 147. <https://doi.org/10.24235/jm.v6i2.8878>
- Bantie, G. M., Woya, A. A., Ayalew, C. A., Mitiku, K. W., Wubetu, G. A., Aynalem, Z. B., ... Melese, A. A. (2023). Food Safety and hygiene practices and the Determinants among street vendors during the Chain of Food Production in Northwest Ethiopia. *Heliyon*, 9(12), e22965. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e22965>
- Creswell, J. W. (2017). *Research Design Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed*. (S. Z. Qudsy, Ed.) (3rd ed.). Yogyakarta, Indonesia: Pustaka Pelajar. Retrieved from <https://opac.perpusnas.go.id/DetailOpac.aspx?id=1213690>
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (5th ed.). Los Angeles, CA, USA: SAGE Publications, Inc. Retrieved from <https://edge.sagepub.com/creswellrd5e>
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2017). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research* (5th ed.). New York, NY, USA: SAGE Publications, Inc. Retrieved from <https://us.sagepub.com/en-us/nam/the-sage-handbook-of-qualitative-research/book242504>
- Fatimah, T. (2011). Pedagang Kaki Lima Sebagai Alternatif Solusi Dalam Mengatasi Kemiskinan dan Pengangguran. *Jurnal Ilmiah Mimbar Demokrasi*, 10(2), 42–53. <https://doi.org/10.21009/jimd.v10i2.1798>
- Grindle, M. S. (2017). *Politics and Policy Implementation in the Third World*. (M. S. Grindle, Ed.) (5th

- ed.). Princeton, NJ, US: Princeton University Press. Retrieved from <https://press.princeton.edu/books/paperback/9780691615875/politics-and-policy-implementation-in-the-third-world>
- Grindle, M. S. (2021). *Bureaucrats, Politicians, and Peasants in Mexico: A Case Study in Public Policy* (1st ed.). Oakland, CA, US: University of California Press. Retrieved from <https://www.ucpress.edu/book/9780520329706/bureaucrats-politicians-and-peasants-in-mexico>
- Higuera, J. P., Hernández, G. C., & Gómez, H.-M. S. (2023). Dataset of conditions and characteristics of street vendors located in public spaces in Colombia. *Data in Brief*, 51, 109689. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dib.2023.109689>
- Johnson, K., & Stake, R. E. (2005). The Art of Qualitative Case Studies. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research* (1st ed., pp. 443–466). London, UK: SAGE Publications, Inc. Retrieved from <https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2005-07735-017>
- Kiger, M. E., & Varpio, L. (2020). Thematic analysis of qualitative data: AMEE Guide No. 131. *Medical Teacher*, 42(8), 846–854. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0142159X.2020.1755030>
- Lawless, B., & Chen, Y.-W. (2019). Developing a Method of Critical Thematic Analysis for Qualitative Communication Inquiry. *Howard Journal of Communications*, 30(1), 92–106. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10646175.2018.1439423>
- Liu, Y., & Liu, Y. (2022). Detecting the city-scale spatial pattern of the urban informal sector by using the street view images: A street vendor massive investigation case. *Cities*, 131, 103959. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2022.103959>
- Lowi, T. J., Ginsberg, B., Shepsle, K. A., & Ansolabehere, S. (2023). *American Government: Power and Purpose* (17th ed.). New York, NY, US: W. W. Norton & Company, Inc. Retrieved from <https://wnnorton.co.uk/books/9781324039679-american-government-core>
- Lowi, T. J., Ginsberg, B., Weir, M., Tolbert, C. J., Campbell, A. L., Francis, M. M., & Spitzer, R. J. (2022). *We the People* (14th ed.). New York, NY, US: W. W. Norton & Company, Inc. Retrieved from <https://wnnorton.co.uk/books/9781324034834-we-the-people-aa24a6d4-d081-4fae-a179-35d7cfa8e768>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, M. A., & Saldaña, J. (2020). *Qualitative data analysis : a methods sourcebook* (4th ed.). Los Angeles, CA, USA: SAGE Publications, Inc. Retrieved from <https://search.worldcat.org/title/1047532295>
- Molin, K. R., Egerod, I., Valentiner, L. S., Lange, P., & Langberg, H. (2016). General practitioners’ perceptions of COPD treatment: thematic analysis of qualitative interviews. *International Journal of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease*, Volume 11, 1929–1937. <https://doi.org/10.2147/COPD.S108611>
- Ramadhan, A. (2015). Implementasi Model Zonasi Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kota Bandung. *Pandecta: Research Law Journal*, 10(1). <https://doi.org/10.15294/pandecta.v10i1.4196>
- Rosales, A. P., Linnemann, A. R., & Luning, P. A. (2023). Food safety knowledge, self-reported hygiene practices, and street food vendors’ perceptions of current hygiene facilities and services - An Ecuadorean case. *Food Control*, 144, 109377. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2022.109377>

- Schaefer, D. L. (2012). *Democratic Decision-Making: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives* (1st ed.). Lexington, MA, US: Lexington Books. Retrieved from <https://www.barnesandnoble.com/w/democratic-decision-making-david-lewis-schaefer/1110867937>
- Scharp, K. M., & Sanders, M. L. (2019). What is a theme? Teaching thematic analysis in qualitative communication research methods. *Communication Teacher*, 33(2), 117–121. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17404622.2018.1536794>
- Tasya, N. K., Nurasa, H., & Isnawaty, N. W. (2022). Evaluasi Program Relokasi Penataan dan Pembinaan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Teras Cihampelas Kota Bandung. *JANE - Jurnal Administrasi Negara*, 13(2), 372. <https://doi.org/10.24198/jane.v13i2.38232>
- Taufik, M. (2012). Kajian Aktivitas Pedagang Kaki Lima di Ruang Publik Kawasan Simpang Lima Pati. *Jurnal Pembangunan Wilayah Dan Kota*, 8(2), 138. <https://doi.org/10.14710/pwk.v8i2.17621>
- Verma, R., Patel, M., Shikha, D., & Mishra, S. (2023). Assessment of food safety aspects and socioeconomic status among street food vendors in Lucknow city. *Journal of Agriculture and Food Research*, 11, 100469. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jafr.2022.100469>
- Warlina, L., Yusuf, M., S Ramadhani, S., & I Ohoitmur, G. (2021). Planning for Relocation Area of Street Food Vendor in Bandung City. *International Journal of Design*, 1(1), 37–42. <https://doi.org/10.34010/injudes.v1i1.4831>
- Watkins, D. C. (2017). Rapid and Rigorous Qualitative Data Analysis. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 16(1), 160940691771213. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406917712131>
- Yanuasri, A. (2015). Karakteristik Pedagang Kaki Lima Pasar Tiban Pada Koridor Pulutan, Jalan Lingkar Salatiga. *Jurnal Pembangunan Wilayah Dan Kota*, 11(2), 142. <https://doi.org/10.14710/pwk.v11i2.10844>
- Yin, R. K. (2012). *Case Study Research. Design and Methods* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23279888>